



**BATA Board of Directors Meeting Agenda**  
Thursday, December 7, 2023 @ 1:00pm  
115 Hall St Traverse City Michigan

1. Call to Order - Chairperson
2. Pledge of Allegiance and Moment of Silence
3. Roll Call
4. First Public Comment\*
5. Approval of Agenda
  - a. BATA Board of Directors Regular Meeting Agenda
6. Consent Calendar

The purpose of the consent calendar is to expedite business by grouping non-controversial items together to be dealt with in one Board motion without discussion. Any member of the Board, staff or the public may ask that any item on the consent calendar be removed and placed elsewhere on the agenda for full discussion. Such requests will be automatically respected. If an item is not removed from the consent calendar, the action noted on the agenda is approved by a single Board action adopting the consent calendar.

*Consideration of Approving the following Minutes*

  - a. *Regular Board of Directors Meeting Minutes of October 26, 2023*
  - b. *Strategic Planning Minutes of October 26, 2023*

*Consideration of Accepting the following Reports*

  - c. *Finance Oversight Team Notes November 20, 2023*
  - d. *FY23 Q4 Scorecard Results*
  - e. *Board Request Tracker – no open items*
  - f. *Correspondence*
7. Any items removed from the Consent Calendar
8. Executive Director's Report – Kelly Dunham
  - a. HQ Facility/Owner's Report  
Jerry Tomczak, Program Manager, Cunningham-Limp
  - b. Hiring Report – Chris Davis
9. Chairperson's Report – Richard Cochrun
10. Committee Reports
  - a. Finance Oversight Team – Richard Cochrun
11. Quarterly Finance Reports – Phil Masserant  
FY23 Q4 Finance Reports
  - a. Statement of Net Position

- b. Operating Reserve Fund Report
  - c. Capital Reserve Fund Report
  - d. New Facility Fund Report
  - e. Technology Fund Report
12. Old Business
13. New Business
- a. Resolution to recognize Heather Harris-Brady Director Contributions
  - b. Diamond Drive Facility
  - c. Automated Passenger Counters (APC) Technology Purchase
  - d. Board Member 2023 Compensation
  - e. Executive Director's 2023 Performance Review and Merit Increase
14. Board Discussion Item
15. Second Public Comment\*
16. Directors Comments/Open Floor
17. Adjournment

*Next Board Meeting: **Thursday, January 25, 2024**, at the Hall St Transfer Station*

**Public Comment:**

Any interested party or person may address the board on any matter of BATA concern during public comment. Comments will be limited to 5 minutes and a one-minute warning will be given when needed. Any public comment that becomes disruptive, unduly repetitive, or impedes the orderly progress of the meeting may be terminated by the presiding officer. Once you have completed your public comment the board may ask any clarifying questions. If needed, you will be assigned a member of BATA's staff to follow up directly on any open concerns.



**BATA Board of Directors Meeting Minutes**

Thursday, October 26, 2023 @ 8:30am  
115 Hall St Traverse City Michigan

1. Call to Order - Chairperson  
Chairperson called the meeting to order at 8:37 am

2. Pledge of Allegiance and Moment of Silence

3. Roll Call

Richard Cochrun	PRESENT
John Somnavilla	PRESENT
Jamie Kramer	TARDY (Arrived at 8:41 am)
Joe Underwood	TARDY (Arrived at 8:40 am)
Heather Harris-Brady	PRESENT
Robert Fudge	PRESENT
Brad Jewett	ABSENT

4. First Public Comment  
No public comment.

5. Approval of Agenda  
a. BATA Board of Directors Regular Meeting Agenda

**On a motion made by John Somnavilla and seconded by Robert Fudge, the BATA Board of Directors approved the Agenda for the October 26, 2023, Regular Board of Directors Meeting as presented.**

6. Consent Calendar  
The purpose of the consent calendar is to expedite business by grouping non-controversial items together to be dealt with in one Board motion without discussion. Any member of the Board, staff or the public may ask that any item on the consent calendar be removed and placed elsewhere on the agenda for full discussion. Such requests will be automatically respected. If an item is not removed from the consent calendar, the action noted on the agenda is approved by a single Board action adopting the consent calendar.

*Consideration of Approving the following Minutes*

a. *Regular Board of Directors Meeting Minutes of September 28, 2023*

*Consideration of Accepting the following Reports*

- b. *FY23 Q4 Ridership Report*
- c. *FY23 Q4 Turnover Report*
- d. *Local Advisory Council Minutes of October 5, 2023*
- e. *Governance Committee Minutes of October 20, 2023*
- f. *Board Request Tracker – no open items*
- g. *Correspondence*

**On a motion made by Robert Fudge and seconded by Heather Harris-Brady, the BATA Board of Directors moved to approve the October 26, 2023, Consent Calendar as presented.**

7. Any items removed from the Consent Calendar  
No items removed from the Consent Calendar
  
8. Executive Director's Report – Kelly Dunham  
Kelly updated the Board on the Image360 partnership with the selected non-profits of Big Brothers Big Sisters, SEEDS, and Single MOMM to be awarded ad space on a vehicle through the partnership. She also informed the Board of a request made to BATA by the DDA's parking advisory committee to operate a downtown circulator route. BATA's position is that more groundwork needs to be done for BATA to consider adding this type of route. BATA's recently completed Transit Master Plan did not have a circulator, nor did the DDA's Transportation Demand Management Study. In lieu of the circulator, BATA is working with the DDA to brand and market the Destination Downtown program and specifically the Bayline to help move people around the downtown area, especially with the upcoming reconstruction of the Grandview Parkway.
  - a. HQ Facility/Owner's Report  
Jerry Tomczak, Program Manager, Cunningham-Limp  
Jerry provided an update to the Board on the current construction of BATA's new Headquarter facility. 50% completion. The project is ahead of schedule and still under budget. Interior wall construction will be started soon as well as the bus wash.
  - b. Hiring Report – Chris Davis  
Chris shared the new hire data with the Board.
  - c. Fall Service Updates – Bill Clark  
Bill provided the Board with an update on the new Fall service updates. Stop changes, downtown destination, Bike-n-Ride, timing tweaks, Route 7, Route 12, Route 2, Park n ride, libraries.
  
9. Chairperson's Report – Richard Cochrun  
Richard stated that he has been talking to riders at Meijer and the Commons to solicit feedback, the feedback received has been positive.
  
10. Committee Reports
  - a. Governance Committee – John Somnavilla  
John shared the current work from the Governance Committee, including the requests to reappoint that were sent to Grand Traverse and Leelanau County Board of Commissioners for John and Robert Fudge.  
Heather commented that with the language of the new Grand Traverse County resolution, the County should solicit the BATA Board of the missing qualifications of Board makeup for new appointments. Kelly will follow up with BATA's attorney on the matter.
  
11. Old Business  
No old business was presented.
  
12. New Business
  - a. 2023 Customer Survey Results – Eric Lingaur  
Eric shared the results of the 2023 Customer Survey.  
Jamie recommended having a clock at stops to help people know if the bus was on time.

John requested information on how the responses were solicited as well as incentives for completing the survey.

Eric shared that the survey was sent out through text, email, digital displays, hard copies, flyers, vehicle announcements, social media, and email.

13. Board Discussion Item  
Kelly recommended that this agenda should be discussed at the strategic meeting happening later today.
14. Second Public Comment  
No public comment.
15. Directors Comments/Open Floor  
No discussion was had.
16. Adjournment

**On a motion made by Robert Fudge moved to adjourn the October 26, 2023, Regular Meeting of the BATA Board of Directors at 9:28 am.**



## **BATA Board of Directors Strategic Planning Session Minutes**

Thursday, October 26, 2023 @ 10:00am

630 E Front St, Traverse City, MI 49686

### Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 10:05am

Members Present: Richard Cochrun, John Somnavilla, Robert Fudge, Jamie Kramer, Heather Harris-Brady

Members Absent: Joe Underwood, Brad Jewett

Staff Present: Kelly Dunham, Chris Davis, Eric Lingaur, Phil Masserant

Others Present: TransPro Consultants, Matt Webb, and David Johnson

### New Business:

TransPro facilitated several activities throughout the day including exercises to define BATA's success outcomes, revisions to its mission and vision statements and a draft of a revised list of values.

Discussion was held throughout the day regarding increasing communication and service levels that add value to the community and adding community value as a success outcome to its 2024 scorecard.

Next steps include soliciting feedback from staff on the draft values. A completed refresh of BATA's strategic plan with the 2024 scorecard will be presented to the Board of Directors for adoption at its January regular meeting.

The meeting was adjourned at 4:35pm

**BATA**  
**Finance Oversight Team**  
**Notes**  
**12:00pm November 20, 2023**  
**3233 Cass Road, Traverse City, MI**

**Present: Richard Cochrun, Bob Fudge, John Somnavilla, Kelly Dunham, Chris Davis, Phil Masserant, Jerry Tomczak**

**1. Progressive AE Updated Additional Compensation Request**

The FOT received and discussed a revised request from Progressive for added compensation due to the increased costs associated with the facility project over the multiple years the project has spanned. The original additional amount of \$235,000 was reduced to \$121,588.08 and substantiated with their labor cost increase over the duration of the project. The FOT supported the added compensation which will be funded through the owner contingency budget line item.

**2. Diamond Drive Facility Discussion**

Staff provided an update to the FOT regarding the storage capacity options on the new facility site and recommended relisting the Diamond Drive facility. There are several options to add additional storage capacity both within the existing footprint (via a mezzanine) as well as a potential build out within the existing area designated for future expansion and a stand-alone storage building which could be approved via an administrative amendment to the PUD. With all of those options available, it seems prudent to proceed with the sale of the Diamond Drive facility as originally planned. Consensus from the FOT was to relist the property; the recommendation will be made to the BATA Board on December 7, 2023.

**3. Procurement Process for New Facility Purchases Over \$25,000**

The FOT discussed the nuance of verbiage in BATA's Purchasing, Authorization, and Payment Policy (which requires approval by the BATA Board of Directors for local purchases over \$25,000) and if purchases within the Board approved owner direct budget need an additional approval step or if the process for these expenditures would be handled similarly to the annual capital fund budget. The FOT consensus was that their expectation is that staff operate in the previously established budget parameters for the project without additional approvals (as is done with the annual capital purchases). If purchases exceed that budget, additional board approval would be needed.

**4. FY23 Q4 Org Scorecard Finance Metrics Results**

The FOT reviewed the finance metric outcomes from Q4 of FY23 which will be presented to the Board on December 7<sup>th</sup>. Suggestions were offered for formatting the FY24 Scorecard in an easier to read fashion.

#### **5. Automated Passenger Counters (APCs) Purchase**

The FOT reviewed the request from staff to proceed with the purchase of the APC's originally provided as an option on the RFP response from GMV/Synchromatics. Grant funding is available to fund the originally specified 55 vehicles, with 2 additional vehicles requiring a local capital allocation. APC technology is needed for efficient reporting to the NTD as required as a small urban transit system. The FOT will recommend the Board approve the request for purchase at the December 7<sup>th</sup> meeting.



2023 Organization Performance Scorecard															
Strategy	Metric	2022 Benchmark	Performance Goal	Points	Metric Definition	Data Source	Q1	Pts	Q2	Pts	Q3	Pts	Q4	Pts	
Safe	Safety	Preventable Passenger Injuries per 500k miles	0.34	0.34	5	Number of preventable passenger injuries per 500k miles.	Passenger Injury Log & Max miles report	0	5	0	5	0	5	0	5
		Days Since Last Preventable Accident	45	48	5	Higest number of days between all preventable accidents. This includes both non-reportable and reportable collisions. Number can roll over from previous quarters.	Accident Log	20	2.1	45	4.7	49	5	36	3.75
		Preventable Reportable Collisions (per 100k miles)	0.3	0.2	10	Number of preventable, reportable vehicle collisions recorded each quarter per 100k miles driven	{Recordable Accident Log (801/802)/ Total Miles} x 100,000	0.5	4.0	0.7	2.9	0.2	10	0.4	7
		# of days between employee injuries	118	40	5	Number of days between employee reportable injuries	Injury log	50	5	52	5	127	5	107	5
					25					16	18	25	21		
Efficient	Financial Success	Cost recovery	9.25%	9.25%	5	The percent of eligible operating expenses recovered by direct revenues	QuickBooks	10.93%	5.0	12.15%	5.0	11.09%	5.0	11.20%	5.0
		Operating Expense per Hour	\$77.64	\$77.64	5	Total eligible operating costs divided by number of service hours	QuickBooks	\$75.50	5.0	\$79.56	4.9	\$76.47	5.0	\$78.16	5.0
		Operating Expense per Mile	\$5.35	\$5.35	5	Total eligible operating costs divided by number of miles	QuickBooks	\$5.03	5.0	\$5.44	4.9	\$5.18	5.0	\$4.95	5.0
		Operating Expense per Trip	\$33.84	\$33.84	5	Total eligible operating costs divided by number trips	QuickBooks	\$ 23.47	5.0	\$ 24.76	5.0	\$25.58	5.0	\$27.01	5.0
					20					20	20	20	20		
High-Quality	Customer Experience	Net Promoter Score	64%	67%	10	The percentage of promoters minus the percentage of detractors in response to the Net Promoter Score question (Annually)	Customer Survey	56%	8.4	56%	8.4	56%	8.4	58%	8.7
		Overall Customer Satisfaction	84%	88%	10	Average percentage of customer satisfaction with BATA's service delivery. (Annually)	Customer Survey	79%	9.0	79%	9.0	79%	9.0	82%	9.3
						20					17.3	17.4	17.4	18.0	
	Employee Success	Employee Satisfaction	84%	88%	10	Overall score on annual survey which determines if employees feel they would refer BATA to their friends/family	Annual survey in June	84%	10	84%	10	84%	10	79%	9
		Employees' Equipped for Success	88%	92%	10	Overall score on annual survey which determines if employees feel as though they have the tools needed to deliver quality service	Annual survey in June	88%	10	88%	10	88%	10	96%	10
				20					20.0	20.0	20.0	19.0			
Reliable	Performance-Based Culture	Average Department Scorecard Score	92%	95%	5	A quarterly average of departmental performance scores	Dept. Scorecards	94%	4.9	94%	4.9	98%	5	89%	4.7
		Monthly Departmental Scorecard Results Shared	NA	100%	5	Departmental Scorecard results shared within each department each month	Monthly Departmental Report	100%	5	100%	5	100%	5	100%	5
		Bus Observations by Admin Staff		100%	5	An average of 3 bus observations/quarter performed by each member of the admin staff	SmartSheet Dataset	86%	4.3	82%	4.1	92%	4.6	83%	4.15
					15					14.2	14.0	14.6	13.8		
<b>Overall Performance Score</b>				<b>100</b>					<b>88</b>	<b>89</b>	<b>97</b>	<b>92</b>			

**FW: End-User Update-Bruce Anthony Galvan Traverse City Michigan...**

Kelly Dunham <dunhamk@bata.net>

Wed 11/29/2023 11:33 AM

To: Britny Schwartz <schwartzb@bata.net>

Board Correspondence....

---

**From:** Kelly Dunham

**Sent:** Wednesday, November 29, 2023 11:33 AM

**To:** 'Bruce Galvan' <galvanbruce13@gmail.com>

**Cc:** Chris Davis <davisc@bata.net>

**Subject:** RE: End-User Update-Bruce Anthony Galvan-Traverse City Michigan...

Good Morning Mr. Galvan,

Thank you for your interest in BATA. We will review your credentials and be in contact if there is an opportunity matching your qualifications.

Best,

Kelly Dunham

Kelly Dunham

Executive Director

Bay Area Transportation Authority

p 231.933.5544

c 231.675.2885

*BATA DELIVERS SAFE, HIGH-QUALITY, EFFICIENT, AND RELIABLE TRANSPORTATION SERVICES IN ITS REGION THAT LINK PEOPLE, JOBS, AND COMMUNITIES.*

---

**From:** Bruce Galvan <galvanbruce13@gmail.com>

**Sent:** Monday, November 27, 2023 4:03 PM

**To:** BATA Board <bataboard@bata.net>

**Subject:** Fwd: End-User Update-Bruce Anthony Galvan-Traverse City Michigan...

See Resume doc,

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Bruce Galvan** <galvanbruce13@gmail.com>

Date: Mon, Nov 27, 2023, 3:57 PM

Subject: End-User Update-Bruce Anthony Galvan-Traverse City Michigan...

To: <bataboard@bata.net>

Honorable Bata Board Members:

I am an end user, Passenger Secure, and Shuttle Driver for propane hybrid Ford buses in Traverse City and Duluth. I ride and passively secure many types of configurations with mass transit, generally. I help very passively, Indian Trails and Amtrak, as well.

With this being said, I am enclosing some basic docs for your review. I want to graciously thank the board for a consistent excellent job. This is my third year and the BATA has an excellent reputation.

Going forward I would like to extend my freelance strengths to secure you formally with an offer for employment, if this is acceptable to your off season situation...


Find docs enclosed if you are interested. I would like to enclose my credentials for driving shuttle authority should you have any questions or concerns going forward...

Again, thanks a million!!

Regards,  
Bruce A Galvan  
[galvanbruce13@gmail.com](mailto:galvanbruce13@gmail.com)  
2314926791

 [Galvan BSA Report 9-7-23.pdf](#)

 [20230501\\_123622.pdf](#)

 [20230122\\_142402.jpg](#)

 [20230122\\_142410.jpg](#)

 [20230604\\_165648.jpg](#)

 [RegAck-6219628671.pdf](#)

 [Receipt\\_sss\\_rv.pdf](#)

To: The BATA Board of Directors

November 28, 2023

My second term on the BATA Board of Directors is drawing to a close, and three years ago I noted that this second term would be my last when I accepted it. It seems appropriate to pause and note how extraordinary the past six years have been. During my two terms I had the unique opportunity to serve on two new committees – the Facility Ad Hoc Committee and the Governance Committee.

The Facility Ad Hoc Committee was a short-term creation, and served its purpose of evaluating locations for the new facility. The Governance Committee formed to develop additional documentation to bring some best practices typical of other boards to BATA.

As an at-large member of the board and a taxpayer who has lived in both counties, I carried out my board duties as I believed my fellow taxpayers would wish. By approving the millage the voters approved BATA and my decision-making was driven by a goal to get all of us the most for our dollars while keeping BATA functioning at the highest level possible. As we know, that is always a shifting balance depending on need, budget, and personnel.

I first interviewed for this spot to give back to a community that has given much to me. I have never accepted a per diem and as I work full-time I have used personal/vacation time for all BATA meetings. (Thank you to my fellow subcommittee members who would meet around lunch.) I started a master's program three years ago but put it mostly on hiatus during my second BATA term, so now it's time for me to get back to that work.

One of the roles of the Governance Committee is to help maintain a balance of talents on the board, to provide BATA with a well-rounded table of expertise for decision-making. Therefore, the Governance Committee will survey the board composition and determine what skills may be needed when the at-large seat is advertised. Regardless of skills, I hope that you will find someone for the at-large seat that believes in BATA and public transit as strongly as I do.

It has been my privilege to serve the region as one of your fellow BATA board members. Thank you to the 2017 BATA Board for giving me the opportunity, and thank you to the 2020 BATA Board for renewing my at-large position.

Best,

Heather Harris-Brady

At-Large Member, Term Expiring 12/31/2023

--

Heather Brady  
Marketing & Communications Manager  
Traverse Area District Library  
[www.tadl.org](http://www.tadl.org)  
231.932.8501  
Pronouns: She, Her, Hers

Reading: *Dealing with Dragons* by Patricia C. Wrede

## FW: Rides

Kelly Dunham <dunhamk@bata.net>

Wed 11/29/2023 1:58 PM

To: Britny Schwartz <schwartzb@bata.net>

Board Correspondence...

-----Original Message-----

From: Kelly Dunham

Sent: Wednesday, November 29, 2023 1:58 PM

To: 'Patti Reamer' <mamarabbit23@yahoo.com>

Subject: RE: Rides

Good Afternoon Ms. Reamer,

Thank you for reaching out to the BATA Board with your concerns. The WRC parking lot is indeed a difficult one for us to service, especially during the winter months. In fact, WRC has asked that we not attempt to enter the rear area. They have assured us that there is someone there that can assist you with mobility assistance getting to and from the bus when needed.

If you need additional assistance coordinating that assistance, please reach out to me directly.

Best,

Kelly Dunham

Kelly Dunham

Executive Director

Bay Area Transportation Authority

p 231.933.5544

c 231.675.2885

BATA DELIVERS SAFE, HIGH-QUALITY, EFFICIENT, AND RELIABLE TRANSPORTATION SERVICES IN ITS REGION THAT LINK PEOPLE, JOBS, AND COMMUNITIES.

-----Original Message-----

From: Patti Reamer <mamarabbit23@yahoo.com>

Sent: Monday, November 27, 2023 9:05 PM

To: BATA Board <bataboard@bata.net>

Subject: Rides

My name is Patti Reamer, 3547 La Casita Ave, Apt 101, Traverse City 49684.

I'm 68 years old and have epilepsy. It is under control with medicine. I have not driven in, I think, 4 years. I tried driving after getting my seizures under control but my driving was so bad I had to give it up.

I worked at the Post Office in Grawn and my daughter was driving me back and forth to work. It got to be too much so I retired early. After sitting at home for approximately 2 years I decided to volunteer at the Woman's Resource Center. I love it. The staff is great and I have a purpose now.

Well, we are now in winter and BATA supervisor says they will only drop me off and pick me up at WRC at the driver's discretion. I mentioned I would go in before they opened and would leave after donations closed so vehicles are not blocking the back where BATA would have to turn around. No go. I found out today that BATA used to go to WRC until a driver hit a very expensive vehicle. Not fair. BATA wants me, 68 years old with epilepsy, to walk down our drive to Pizza Hut. Somehow this doesn't seem right to me. Today I called BATA and told a gentleman I couldn't walk to Pizza Hut and how do I get home? His answer was "I don't know". I'm on social security and have to pay for my own rides to my volunteer job. Can you please help me with this matter.

Thank you for your consideration.  
231-633-8323

Today so I wouldn't have to pay a taxi a coworker drove me to Pizza Hut to catch the bus.

Sent from my iPhone

## November/December 2023 Executive Director's Report

### The Highlight Reel:

#### *Internal*

- Onboarded 8 new drivers.
- Conducted open enrollment with all staff.
- Improved call flow by upgrading the phone system and began exploring cloud-based solutions.
- Applied 4 new ad campaigns on buses.
- Issued RFP for 2024 communication plan.
- Received another new bus, with 2 more due to arrive before the end of the year, which will allow us to start decommissioning some of the older ones we've been limping along.

#### *External*

- Hosted a community walk through of the new facility, providing a tour to approximately 15 Rotarians that were interested in our project.
- Provided 1079 free rides for election day (652) and Veterans Day (427).
- Conducted public outreach to Leadership Grand Traverse, NMC, and the public at TADL.
- Participated in the annual Holiday Light Parade and Toys for Tots.
- Additional Holiday event at the Salvation Army Light Up the Night (12/18).
- Attended the MPTA monthly board meeting and Legislative Committee meeting.
- Kelly, Eric, and Chris attended the annual Traverse Connect Economic Outlook luncheon.
- Attended the meet and greet with the new Director of the Future of Mobility and Electrification.

#### *On the agenda:*

- This meeting will be Heather Harris-Brady's last meeting. We will recognize her contributions with a resolution.
- With analysis of options for additional storage capacity at the new site completed, the FOT is recommending the relisting of Diamond Drive.
- The staff is seeking approval to proceed with exercising the option of Automated Passenger Counters, as provided in the original RFP response from GMV Synchronatics (our CAD/AVL provider).
- Britny has compiled an attendance matrix for eligible board members wishing to receive compensation for their time served on the BATA Board. This will be distributed, and opt-in/out forms collected at the meeting.
- Chris Davis will present the results of my annual performance evaluation.

Submitted by: Kelly Dunham

STAFFING UPDATE – DECEMBER 7, 2023

BAY AREA TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY

Driver staffing goal to meet the Transit Master Plan for full service – 81 FTE

Driver FTE goal to meet current service level – 72.3 FTE

Current Service Level FTE needed – 3.9 FTE

Chris Davis



**BATA Income Statement**  
**For the Twelve Months Ending September 2023**

	September 2023 YTD			Budget Variance	Annual Budget	Budget Remaining	% of Budget
	Actual	Budget					
<b>Revenues</b>							
Fare Box Revenue	\$ 557,092	<u>1</u> \$ 382,065	\$ 175,027	\$ 382,065	\$ (175,027)	146%	
Auxiliary Trans Revenue	197,574	<u>2</u> 133,106	64,468	133,106	(64,468)	148%	
Non-Trans Revenue	10,483	761	9,722	761	(9,722)	1377%	
Local Revenue	4,812,408	<u>3</u> 4,521,234	291,174	4,521,234	(291,174)	106%	
Local Service Contract	302,886	288,844	14,042	288,844	(14,042)	105%	
State Formula & Contracts	3,739,071	<u>4</u> 4,154,215	(415,144)	4,154,215	415,144	90%	
Federal Operating Grants	1,862,509	<u>4</u> 2,164,538	(302,029)	2,164,538	302,029	86%	
CRRSAA/CARES Act	1,788,053	<u>4</u> 2,094,583	(306,529)	2,094,583	306,529	85%	
Other Revenue: Interest	618,274	<u>5</u> 132,806	485,468	132,806	(485,468)	466%	
Other Revenue: Refunds and Credits	227,804	<u>6</u> 32,422	195,382	32,422	(195,382)	703%	
<b>Total Revenues</b>	<b>\$ 14,116,154</b>	<b>\$ 13,904,573</b>	<b>\$ 211,581</b>	<b>\$ 13,904,573</b>	<b>\$ (211,581)</b>	<b>102%</b>	
<b>Expenses</b>							
Salaries & Wages	5,152,041	<u>7</u> 6,140,337	(988,296)	6,140,337	988,296	84%	
Paid Leave	347,530	441,264	(93,734)	441,264	93,734	79%	
Fringe Benefits	2,078,327	<u>7</u> 1,911,747	166,580	1,911,747	(166,580)	109%	
Services	706,764	772,037	(65,273)	772,037	65,273	92%	
Fuel & Lubricants	605,689	<u>8</u> 1,108,719	(503,030)	1,108,719	503,030	55%	
Materials & Supplies	358,199	427,028	(68,829)	427,028	68,829	84%	
Utilities	130,676	149,262	(18,586)	149,262	18,586	88%	
Insurance	657,747	<u>9</u> 593,358	64,389	593,358	(64,389)	111%	
Misc Expense	51,292	39,613	11,679	39,613	(11,679)	129%	
Interest			-				
Operating Leases & Rentals	15,211	17,472	(2,261)	17,472	2,261	87%	
<b>Total Expenses before Depreciation</b>	<b>10,103,477</b>	<b>11,600,837</b>	<b>(1,591,094)</b>	<b>11,600,837</b>	<b>1,497,360</b>	<b>87%</b>	
<b>Net Income before Depreciation</b>	<b>4,012,677</b>	<b>2,303,736</b>	<b>1,802,675</b>	<b>2,303,736</b>	<b>(1,708,941)</b>	<b>174%</b>	
Depreciation	1,250,474	1,054,291	196,183	1,054,291	(196,183)	119%	
<b>Net Income (Loss)</b>	<b>2,762,203</b>	<b>1,249,445</b>	<b>1,606,492</b>	<b>1,249,445</b>	<b>(1,512,758)</b>	<b>221%</b>	

**BATA Income Statement Notes**  
**For the Twelve Months Ending September 2023**

	<u>Account Name</u>	<u>Explanation</u>
<u>1</u>	Passenger Fares	Increased Ridership; 33% increase over prior year
<u>2</u>	Advertising Revenue	Increase in new advertisements; 52% increase over prior year
<u>3</u>	Taxes Levied by Transit Agency	Increase in property tax values. Majority of taxes are collected on summer tax bill (Jul-Sep). 7% increase over prior year.
<u>4</u>	State Operating Assistance Federal Section 5311 ARPA/CRRSSA/CARES Act	Budget forecasted at full service levels. FY2023 State Operating 34.58%, Federal 5311 Operating 36% (includes 18% ARPA)
<u>5</u>	Interest Income	Fed Funds Rate for August 2023 was 5.33%. It was 2.56% last year.
<u>6</u>	Refunds and Credits	\$119k Insurance claims and \$77k Propane fuel credit
<u>7</u>	Salaries and Fringe Benefits	28% increase over prior year. Increase partially due to one time MERS funding and retention incentive closeout.
<u>8</u>	Fuel & Lubricants	Decrease in gallons consumed and favorable experience in fuel rates
<u>9</u>	Insurance	\$93k insurance claims

**BATA Statement of Net Position  
September 2023**

	<u>Sep 30, 23</u>	<u>Sep 30, 22</u>	<u>\$ Change</u>	<u>% Change</u>
<b>ASSETS</b>				
<b>Current Assets</b>				
ICS/Money Market - General Fund	\$ 1,593,388	\$ 4,103,056	\$ (2,509,668)	-61.2%
ICS/Money Market - Cap/Op Funds	-	1,404,374	(1,404,374)	-100.0%
Treasury Bill - Cap/Op/New Fac	-	8,256,089	(8,256,089)	-100.0%
<b>Total Cash</b>	<u>1,593,388</u>	<u>13,763,519</u>	<u>(12,170,131)</u>	<u>1</u> -88.4%
Michigan Class - General Fund	1,494,640		1,494,640	
Michigan Class - Operating Reserve	2,616,694		2,616,694	
Michigan Class - Capital Reserve	5,233,560		5,233,560	
Michigan Class - New Facility Reserve	5,263,499		5,263,499	
<b>Total Michigan Class</b>	<u>14,608,393</u>	<u>-</u>	<u>13,113,753</u>	<u>2</u>
Accounts Receivable	1,143,562	32,004	1,111,558	3 3473.2%
Due (to) from State	(32,978)	(97,536)	64,558	4 -66.2%
Due from Federal	3,434,886	924,728	2,510,158	5 271.4%
Property Taxes Receivable	741,614	353,568	388,046	6 109.8%
Prepaid Expenses	176,977	99,981	76,996	7 77.0%
<b>Total Current Assets</b>	<u>21,665,842</u>	<u>15,076,264</u>	<u>6,589,578</u>	<u>43.7%</u>
New Facility (CIP)/Land Acquisition	12,898,168	1,644,831	11,253,337	8 684.2%
Fixed Assets (net of depreciation)	5,747,423	5,831,633	(84,210)	-1.4%
Deferred Outflows of Resources for Pension Obl.	738,811	738,811	-	9 0.0%
Net Pension Asset	714,759	714,759	-	9
<b>TOTAL ASSETS</b>	<u>\$ 41,765,003</u>	<u>\$ 24,006,298</u>	<u>\$ 17,758,705</u>	<u>74.0%</u>
<b>LIABILITIES &amp; NET POSITION</b>				
<b>Liabilities</b>				
<b>Current Liabilities</b>				
Accounts Payable	\$ 146,603	\$ 172,428	\$ (25,825)	-15.0%
Accrued Expenses	2,645,925	235,254	2,410,671	10 1024.7%
Deferred Revenue	-	264,577	(264,577)	11 -100.0%
Other Current Liabilities	135,023	111,317	23,706	21.3%
<b>Total Current Liabilities</b>	<u>2,927,551</u>	<u>783,576</u>	<u>2,143,975</u>	<u>273.6%</u>
Net Pension Liability	-	-	-	9 #DIV/0!
Deferred Inflows of Resources for Pension Obl.	919,964	919,964	-	9 0.0%
<b>Total Liabilities</b>	<u>3,847,515</u>	<u>1,703,540</u>	<u>2,143,975</u>	<u>125.9%</u>
<b>Net Position</b>				
<b>Assigned</b>				
Operating Reserve Fund	2,616,694	2,368,732	247,962	10.5%
Capital Fund	5,168,314	1,893,054	3,275,260	173.0%
New Facility Fund	5,075,771	5,313,182	(237,411)	-4.5%
<b>Total Assigned</b>	<u>12,860,778</u>	<u>9,574,968</u>	<u>3,285,811</u>	<u>34.3%</u>
Investment in Capital Assets	18,645,591	7,476,464	11,169,127	149.4%
Restricted for Pension	533,606	533,606	-	0.0%
Unrestricted	5,877,513	4,717,720	1,159,793	24.6%
<b>Total Net Position</b>	<u>37,917,488</u>	<u>22,302,758</u>	<u>15,614,730</u>	<u>12</u> 70.0%
<b>TOTAL LIABILITIES &amp; NET POSITION</b>	<u>\$ 41,765,003</u>	<u>\$ 24,006,298</u>	<u>\$ 17,758,705</u>	<u>74.0%</u>

**BATA Statement of Net Position Notes  
September 2023**

	<u>Account(s)</u>	<u>Explanation</u>
<u>1</u>	Cash	Moved accounts to Michigan Class Investment Pool
<u>2</u>	Michigan Class	Investment Pool started March 2023
<u>3</u>	Accounts Receivable	CY Included large TCHC Receivable for Infrastructure
<u>4</u>	Due from State	State reimburses based on revised budget. Adjusted to state share of eligible operating expenses. Negative represents amount due back to MDOT.
<u>5</u>	Due from Federal	CY includes \$2.2M P29 grant for Christman
<u>6</u>	Property Taxes Receivable	PY Leland Twp collected early on summer tax roll CY Increasing property tax values and timing of summer tax collections
<u>7</u>	Prepaid Expenses	Oct Health premiums and rent were paid in Sep in current year.
<u>8</u>	New Facility (CIP)/Land Acquisition	Increase New Facility Construction costs
<u>9</u>	Deferred Outflows of Resources Deferred Inflows of Resources Net Pension Liability	<p><b>GASB 68 audit adjustment, as of 9/30/22</b></p> <p><u>Deferred Outflows of Resources \$738,811</u> Difference in experience \$54,263 Difference in assumptions \$337,555 Contributions subsequent to the measurement date \$346,993</p> <p><u>Deferred Inflows of Resources (\$919,964)</u> Difference in experience change (\$133,781) Difference between projected and actual earnings (\$786,183)</p> <p><u>Net Pension Asset \$714,759</u> Plan fiduciary net position \$10,856,504 Total pension liability (\$10,141,746)</p>
<u>10</u>	Accrued Expenses	CY accrued Sep Christman construction in progress \$2.2M
<u>11</u>	Deferred Revenue	CY amount will be calculated during audit.
<u>12</u>	Net Position	Increase Positive net income

**BATA Operating Reserve Fund  
September 2023 YTD**

	<b>Independent Bank</b>	<b>Michigan Class</b>	<b>Treasury Bill</b>	<b>Adjustments</b>	<b>Reserve Fund Total</b>
<b>Balance at September 30, 2022</b>	\$ 638,931	\$ -	\$ 1,724,269	\$ -	<b>\$ 2,363,200</b>
<b>Increases:</b>					
Interest Income	6,693	67,858			74,551
Investment Income			30,516		30,516
FY22 State LBO Preliminary				148,427	148,427
<b>Total Increases</b>	\$ 6,693	\$ 67,858	\$ 30,516	\$ 148,427	<b>\$ 253,493</b>
<b>Cash Transfers</b>	\$ (645,624)	\$ 2,548,836	\$ (1,754,785)	\$ (148,427)	(0)
<b>Balance at September 30, 2023</b>	\$ -	\$ 2,616,694	\$ -	\$ -	<b>\$ 2,616,694</b>

FY23 Revised Budgeted Expenses

\$ 11,717,139

Balance as a % of FY23 Revised Budgeted Expenses\*

22.3%

\*Maximum Balance = 30%

\$ 3,515,142

**BATA Capital Reserve Fund  
September 2023 YTD**

	Independent Bank	Michigan Class	Treasury Bill	Adjustments	Reserve Fund Total
<b>Balance at September 30, 2022</b>	\$ 765,442	\$ -	\$ 1,120,387	\$ 3,631	\$ 1,889,460
<b>Increases:</b>					
Interest Income	8,020	130,274			138,294
Investment Income			19,828		19,828
FY2023 Funding: 2.5% of budgeted revenue				347,614	347,614
FY2022 Surplus (Approved 4/27/23)				2,948,861	2,948,861
<b>Total Increases</b>	<b>\$ 8,020</b>	<b>\$ 130,274</b>	<b>\$ 19,828</b>	<b>\$ 3,296,475</b>	<b>\$ 3,454,597</b>
<b>Decreases:</b>					
FY23 Q1-#30 (Concrete pads)				(9,500)	(9,500)
FY23 Q2-#49 (DVR's)				(12,518)	(12,518)
FY23 Q3-#30 (Shelters)				(25,775)	(25,775)
FY23 Q3-#52 (Hall St AC)				(29,850)	(29,850)
FY23 Q3-#53 (Hall St boiler)				(21,556)	(21,556)
FY23 Q3-#55 (Hall St door locks)				(6,800)	(6,800)
FY23 Q3-#7A (Rear differential)				(4,499)	(4,499)
FY23 Q4-#54 (Carpet)				(7,131)	(7,131)
FY23 Q4-#9 (IT)				(7,738)	(7,738)
FY23 Q4-#53 (Hall St boiler)				(50,377)	(50,377)
<b>Total Decreases</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ (175,744)</b>	<b>\$ (175,744)</b>
<b>Cash Transfers</b>	<b>(773,462)</b>	<b>5,103,287</b>	<b>(1,140,215)</b>	<b>(3,189,609)</b>	<b>-</b>
<b>Balance at September 30, 2023</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ 5,233,560</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ (65,246)</b>	<b>\$ 5,168,314</b>

**BATA New Facility Reserve Fund  
September 2023 YTD**

	Independent Bank	Michigan Class	Treasury Bill	Adjustments	Reserve Fund Total
<b>Balance at September 30, 2022</b>	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 5,411,433	\$ (98,072)	\$ 5,313,361
<b>Increases:</b>					
Interest Income		95,596	7,663		103,259
Investment Income			122,567		122,567
TCHC Infrastructure Reimbursement				-	-
<b>Total Increases</b>	\$ -	\$ 95,596	\$ 130,230	\$ -	\$ 225,826
<b>Decreases:</b>					
Mansfield Land Use Consultants				(28,498)	(28,498)
Cunningham-Limp				(182,590)	(182,590)
Progressive AE, Inc.				(82,288)	(82,288)
Garfield Charter Township				(68,800)	(68,800)
Grand Traverse Co. DPW				(52,755)	(52,755)
Soils and Structures, Inc.				(41,616)	(41,616)
Various Owner Direct				(6,870)	(6,870)
<b>Total Decreases</b>	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ (463,416)	\$ (463,416)
<b>Cash Transfers</b>		5,167,903	(5,541,663)	373,760	-
<b>Balance at September 30, 2023</b>	\$ -	\$ 5,263,499	\$ -	\$ (187,729)	\$ 5,075,771

*Projected Net Proceeds from Land Sale*

\$ 1,995,000

*TCHC Infrastructure Reimbursement*

\$ 1,071,552

***Projected New Facility Reserve Fund Balance***

**\$ 8,142,323**

**BATA Locally Funded Capital Projects Budget  
FY2023**

<u>Project #</u>	<u>Project Description</u>	<u>Owner</u>	<u>Asset Category</u>	<u>Priority</u>	<u>Useful Life</u>	<u>Budget</u>	<u>Q1-Q4 Spend</u>	<u>Q4 Budget Remaining</u>
<b>Capital Projects Budget, New</b>								
52	Hall St AC Unit Replacement	Kurt	Building Imprvmts	A	10	\$ 24,784	29,850	(5,066)
53	Hall St Boiler Replacement	Kurt	Building Imprvmts	A	10	50,000	71,933	(21,933)
54	Hall St Carpet Replacement	Kurt	Building Imprvmts	C	10	5,000	7,131	(2,131)
55	Hall St DSX Door Locks	Kurt	Building Imprvmts	C	10	10,000	6,800	3,200
		<b>Total</b>				<b>\$ 89,784</b>	<b>\$ 115,714</b>	<b>\$ (25,930)</b>
<b>Capital Projects Budget, Ongoing</b>								
7A	Motors/Transmissions/Body Work	Kurt	Vehicle Parts	A	3	\$ 100,000	4,499	95,501
7B	Bldg/Grds Improvements, Equipment Replacement	Kurt	Buildings	A	6		-	-
9	General IT	Eric	Technology	A	6	7,000	7,738	(738)
13	Local Vehicle Purchase (Buses and Components)	Kurt	Vehicles	A	5-12		-	-
30	Annual Shelter, Bench, Signage and Stop Placemaking	Kurt	Oper Equipmt	A	10	50,000	35,275	14,725
49	Vehicle Technologies (Replacement, e.g. MDTs, Fareboxes, Radios)	Eric	Technology	A	5-10	26,460	12,518	13,942
		<b>Total</b>				<b>\$ 183,460</b>	<b>\$ 60,030</b>	<b>\$ 123,430</b>
<b>Capital Projects Budget, Contingency (10% of budget)</b>						<b>\$ 27,324</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>\$ 27,324</b>
<b>Total</b>						<b>\$ 300,568</b>	<b>\$ 175,744</b>	<b>\$ 124,825</b>





Resolution Honoring

**Heather Harris-Brady**

WHEREAS: Heather Harris-Brady served on the Bay Area Transportation Authority Board of Directors from May 30, 2018 to December 31, 2023;

WHEREAS: Heather Harris-Brady served as a member of BATA’s facility ad hoc committee, evaluating options and identifying the site for a new BATA Headquarters facility;

WHEREAS: Heather Harris-Brady advocated for “thinking bigger” in regard to BATA’s need for a new facility which ultimately led to the partnership with the Traverse City Housing Commission to co-purchase the land for workforce housing to be built adjacent to BATA’s new transfer station;

WHEREAS: Heather Harris-Brady’s contributions to the facility project were integral to BATA’s success in receiving a \$13,380,000 grant award from the Federal Transit Administration to fund the project;

WHEREAS: Heather Harris-Brady served as a member of BATA’s newly formed governance committee from January 2022 through December 31, 2023, establishing and implementing several policies to ensure the effective operation of BATA’s Board of Directors;

WHEREAS: Heather Harris-Brady has consistently supported BATA’s mission and brought forth ideas to better reach the public, elected bodies, and Leelanau County stakeholders;

WHEREAS: Heather Harris-Brady has reliably and thoughtfully served as a BATA Director, offering creative promotional concepts such as offering a BATA pass to be checked out from libraries, Bayline promotions to visitors, millage campaign ideas, and more;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Bay Area Transportation Authority Board of Directors hereby honors Heather Harris-Brady for her five and a half years of dedicated service and leadership to the Bay Area Transportation Authority.

Presented this 7<sup>th</sup> day of December 2023

Ayes:  
Nays:

Approved this 7<sup>th</sup> day of December 2023

\_\_\_\_\_  
Director

\_\_\_\_\_  
Director

\_\_\_\_\_  
Director

\_\_\_\_\_  
Director

\_\_\_\_\_  
Director

\_\_\_\_\_  
Director

ATTEST:  
\_\_\_\_\_

Secretary, Board of Directors

# memo

To: BATA Board of Directors  
From: Kelly Dunham  
CC: Shaughn Handley, BATA Procurement & Grants Specialist  
Date: 11/30/2023  
Re: Automatic Passenger Counter Purchase

---

The previously awarded CAD/AVL software RFP included an option for Automatic Passenger Counters (APCs), which we would like to move forward with at this time. The technology provided by APCs is necessary for the data capturing that is needed for reporting to the National Transit Database (NTD), now required as a result of becoming a small urban system.

Request: Board approval of exercising the option originally included in the GMV/Syncromatics RFP response for the grant funded procurement of the APC's in the amount of \$148,325 (\$140,250 + \$8,075 in Prog. Mgt).

GMV APC Option from CAD/AVL RFP Response:

<b>Automatic Passenger Counting</b>				
LN	Item Description	Qty	Unit Cost	Subtotal
	Hardware, IRIS APC - 1 Door Bus, 1 Sensor	55	1,620	89,100
	Installation, Per Bus, APC - 1 Door Bus	55	490	26,950
	Hardware, IRIS APC - 2 Door Bus, 2 Sensors	0	2,340	-
	Installation, Per Bus, APC - 2 Door Bus	0	780	-
	Vehicle and System Licenses, APC	55	440	24,200
<b>Total, Capital</b>				<b>140,250</b>



I agree that I have reviewed the presented BATA Board of Directors attendance log and certify that this information is true and correct.

I understand that the policy for BATA Board of Directors is to receive compensation in the amount of \$40.00 per meeting for all regularly scheduled Board Meetings, Special Meetings and Committee Meetings attended.

I would like to receive my compensation as follows:

\_\_\_\_\_ I would like to receive a check mailed to my home address.

\_\_\_\_\_ I would like to waive my compensation for all attended meetings for the 2023 calendar year.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature

\_\_\_\_\_  
Name

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

Board Member	1.16.23 Governance Committee	1.16.23 Finance Oversight Team	1.26.23 Regular and Organizational	2.13.23 Governance Committee	2.13.23 Finance Oversight Team	2.23.23 Regular	3.13.23 Governance Committee	4.17.23 Finance Oversight Team	4.27.23 Regular	5.22.23 Finance Oversight Team	6.12.23 Governance	6.12.23 Finance Oversight Team	6.29.23 Regular	7.24.23 Finance Oversight Team	8.7.23 Finance Oversight Team	8.10.23 Regular	8.14.23 Finance Oversight Team	8.24.23 Special Board Meeting	9.18.23 Governance Committee	9.18.23 Finance Oversight Team	10.20.23 Governance Committee	10.26.23 Regular and Strategic	11.20.23 Finance Oversight Team	12.7.23 Regular	Single Meeting Attendance Total	Full Day Meeting Attendance Total	Payment Due	Agreement Signed?	
Richard Cochran		Present	Present		Present	Present		Present	Present	Present		Present	Present	Present	Absent	Present	Present	Present		Absent		Present	Present		16	1			
John Sommovilla	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present		23	1			
Robert Fudge	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present		23	1			
Heather Harris-Brady	Present		Present	Present		Present	Present		Present		Present		Absent		Present	Present		Present	Present		Present	Present			12	1			
Brad Jewett			Present			Present			Present				Absent			Absent		Present				Absent			4	0			
Jamie Kramer			Absent			Present			Present				Present			Present		Present				Present			6	1			
Joe Underwood			Present			Present			Present				Present					Absent				Present for Regular Absent for Strategic				5	0		